

CONTENTS

IN MEMORIAM: JUDGE BATTS

- 1 In Memoriam: Judge Deborah A. Batts

SYMPOSIUM—IN MEMORIAM: JUSTICE GINSBURG

- 5 Tribute to Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg *Martha Minow*
- 15 In Memoriam: Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg, The Last Civil Rights Lawyer on the Supreme Court *Tomiko Brown-Nagin*
- 27 Tribute to Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg *Michael J. Klarman*

ARTICLES

- 37 When Cruelty Is the Point: Family Separation as Unconstitutional Torture *Jenny-Brooke Condon*
- 77 Swab Before You Enter: DNA Collection and Immigration Control *Tally Kritzman-Amir*
- 115 Words Still Wound: IIED & Evolving Attitudes toward Racist Speech *Tasnim Motala*

NOTES

- 169 Proliferating Predation: Reverse Redlining, the Digital Proliferation of Inferior Social Welfare Products, and How to Stop It *Sam Gilman*

Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review

Harvard Law School
Caspersen Student Center
1585 Massachusetts Avenue, Suite 2048
Cambridge, MA 02138
www.harvardcrcl.org

The *Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review* is published semiannually by Harvard Law School students.

Submissions: The editors invite the submission of unsolicited manuscripts and consider them on a rolling basis. Articles may be submitted via “scholastica” or by email. Detailed submission requirements are available at www.harvardcrcl.org/submissions/. Submissions should be typed, double-spaced, and sent in an editable Microsoft Word format. Footnotes must comply with *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (Columbia Law Review Ass’n et al. eds., 21st ed. 2020).

Subscriptions: Subscription rates for the 2021 volume (Volume 56) are \$42 domestic and \$52 international (including Canada). For some international subscribers, delivery via airmail may be more reliable than standard service. Please note in your inquiry if you would like airmail or ground delivery. All correspondence concerning subscriptions should be addressed to the Subscriptions Manager, Student Journals Office, Harvard Law School, 1585 Massachusetts Avenue, Suite 3039, Cambridge, MA 02138; +1 (617) 495-3694; email to journals@law.harvard.edu. Claims for missing issues of Volume 56 will be honored until June 2022.

Back Issues: Back issues may be ordered directly from our publisher, Joe Christensen, Inc., 1540 Adams Street, Lincoln, NE 68521. Orders may also be placed by calling +1 (800) 228-5030. Back issues can also be found in electronic format for all your research needs on HeinOnline: <http://heinonline.org>.

Permission to Copy: The articles in this issue may be reproduced and distributed, in whole or in part, by nonprofit institutions for educational purposes, including distribution to students, provided that the copies are distributed at or below cost and identify the author, the *Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review*, the volume, the number of the first page, and the year of the article’s publication.



Editors-in-Chief

Mo Light
Armani Madison
Caroline E. Milosevich
Alexandra Wolfson

***Executive Managing Editors for Executive Managing Editor for Executive Managing Editors for
Outside Articles Student Writing Solicited Content***

Zack Manley
Daniel Polonsky
Sam Stratton

Ebony Slaughter-Johnson

Jimmy Biblarz
Kevin Kowalewski

***Executive Editors for Online
Content***

Sara Carter
Laura Follansbee
Mark Haidar
Matt Meyer

***Executive Editor for Audio
Content***

(Anna) Mayze Teitler

***Executive Managing Editors for
Operations***

Beth Feldstein
Katie Quigley
Tiffany Rodriguez

***Managing Editor for
Events***

Lexi Butler

***Managing Editor for Outreach
& Partnerships***

Dessie Otachliska

***Managing Editor for Alumni
Engagement***

Amy Frieder

***Solicited Content
Editors***

Connor Burwell
Kimberly Quick
Fred Messner
Mariah K. Watson

***Managing Editors for Diversity
& Inclusion***

Malik Gerdes
Gwendolyn Gissendanner

***Student Writing
Editors***

Mackenzie Arnold
Joy Holden
Sarah Margulies
Sarah Rutherford

***Lead Outside Articles
Editors***

Carly Margolis
Dan Meyer
Isabel Patkowski
Hassaan Shahawy
Anna Sherman-Weiss
Jacob Steinberg-Otter

***Secondary Outside Article
Editors***

Zachary Cohen
September McCarthy
Caroline Pearson
Nikita Rumsey
Emma Shirey
Catherine Willett

***Audio Content
Editors***

Robby Erikson
Amy Hayes
Laura Garcia
Caroline Graif
Iman Mohamed

Article Selection Editors

Christopher Arce
Amber Aspinall
Grace Bennett
Grant Chamness
Emily Chazen
Nicole L. Franklin
Lauren Fukumoto
Zoe Ginsberg
Stephanie Gullo
Lauren Hirsch
Anna Jessurun
Zak Kadish
Jack Lubin
William Roberts
Caitlin Rooney
Nicole Rubin
Chris Stevenson
Natassia Velez
Samantha Wintner
Annie Wilt

Online Content Editors

Abraham Barkhordar
Katherine Bohrs
Jacob Carrel
Amanda Epstein
Annamarie Forestiere
Sarasose Gaines
Madeleine Gates
Abigail Liles
Ethan Lowens
Sarah Maher
Juan Palacio Moreno
Francis Swanson
Melissa Wen

Executive Technical Editors

Micaiah Barley
Rachel Casper
Patrick Cremin
Thomas Freeman
Dana Horowitz
Jordan Isern
Emma Keteltas
Bernice Kwan
Nathan Lobel
Max Lupin
Michael Migiel-Schwartz
Julia More
Alexis Picard
Madeleine Rogers
Sarah Rubin
Chris Stevenson
Brendan Schneiderman
Katherine Valde
Leah Weiser
Melissa Wen

Adam Aguirre
Mackenzie Arnold
Micaiah Barley
Katharine Bohrs
Grant Chamness
Patrick Cremin
Amanda Epstein
Annamarie Forestiere
Thomas Freeman
Laura Garcia
Zoe Ginsberg
Isaac Green
Lauren Hirsch
Kevin Kowalewski
Abigail Liles
Max Lupin
Zack Manley
Nora McDonnell
Dan Meyer
Caroline Pearson
Madeleine Rogers
Nicole Rubin
Aiyanna Sanders
Beshoy Shokralla
Chris Stevenson
Alex Tobin
Melissa Wen
Annie Wilt

Hillary Aarons
Tyler Ambrose
Sarah Armstrong
Michael Blank
Erika Brigantti-Abraham
Katy Chu
Gabrielle Crofford
Anna Dorman
Casandra Ferrante
Mikhaila Fogel
Jason Golfinos
Delaney Herndon
Peter Jen
Victoria Kalumbi
Dasha Kolyaskina
Jessica Levy
Stacy Livingston
Geoffrey McGee
Lily Moens
Sebastian Negrón-Reichard
Anna Rashad
Georgia Rochon
Dylan Sanders
Becca Scribner
Abbie Starker
Rosalie Teed
Suzanne Van Arsdall
Catherine Walker-Jacks
Riley Worrell

Randall Kennedy,
Professor of Law,
Harvard Law School

Article Selection Board

Avita Anand
Amber Aspinall
Grace Bennett
Dan Brown
Emily Chazen
Antonia Diener
Robby Erikson
Laura Follansbee
Amy Frieder
Madeleine Gates
Gwendolyn Gissendanner
Stephanie Gullo
Aleena Ijaz
Shira Kotz
Lucy Litt
Sarah Maher
Carly Margolis
Will McElhaney
Michael Migiel-Schwartz
Daniel Polonsky
Caitlin Rooney
Nikita Rumsey
Anna Sherman-Weiss
Ebony Slaughter-Johnson
Sam Stratton
Katherine Valde
Leah Weiser
Samantha Wintner

Citation Checkers

Anita Alem
Blake Andersen
Delaney Barker
Sarah Blatt-Herold
Samantha Camy
Christina Coleburn
Allie Cunningham
Daniel Ergas
Madison Ferris
Ali Gentry
Mattie Haag
Avery Holloman
Joshua Jordan
Priya Kamath
Raya Koreh
Victoria Li
Carlos Martinez
Marcus Miller
Emilie Montgomery
Sheryl Ott
Ruby Ritchin
Andrew Rossi-Schroeder
David Scharf
Amika Singh
Corey Stewart
Virginia Thomas
Rosa Vargas
Sibo Wang
Eric Xu

Board of Advisors

Martha Minow,
Professor of Law,
Harvard Law School
Mark Tushnet,
Professor of Law,
Harvard Law School

Christopher Arce
Abraham Barkhordar
Jimmy Biblarz
Rachel Casper
Ava Cilia
Sophie d'Orchimont
Beth Feldstein
Nicole L. Franklin
Saraose Gaines
Malik Gerdes
Matt Goldkind
Amy Hayes
Zak Kadish
Jon Levitan
Jack Lubin
Hannah Makowske
September McCarthy
Stacey Menjivar
Kaitlynn Milvert
William Roberts
Chelsea Rooney
Sarah Rutherford
Emma Shirey
Jacob Steinberg-Otter
Francis Swanson
Natassia Velez
Catherine Willett
Eric Zilber

Daisy Almonte
Lauren Andrews
Anna Binting
Olivia Blom
Pety Carzis
John Crawford
Taylor Dodson
Amber Feng
Travis Fife
Leonard Giarrano
Diana Haigney
Dylan Hosmer-Quint
Joseph Jung
Jaspreet (Rosie) Kaur
Emma Leibowitz
Lars Lindgren
Micah McCreary
Alyssa Milstead
Jessica Nelson
Jasmine Phillips-Acie
Thomas Roberts
Alex Ropes
Alexander Schwenicke
Emma Sherry
Juliana Stone
Andrea Trespalacios
Elena Vazquez
Annie Woronecki
Elaine Zhong

Deborah Ramirez,
Professor of Law,
Northeastern University
School of Law