The Harvard Environmental Law Review

VOLUME 39 • 2015 • NUMBER 1

Contents

Symposium

- 1 Climate Regulation Under the Clean Air Act in the Wake of *Utility Air Regulatory Group v. EPA*: Introduction *Cecilia Segal*
- 9 Why I Worry About *UARG Jody Freeman*
- 23 Text in Context: The Fate of Emergent Climate Regulation After *UARG* and *EME Homer*Ann E. Carlson and Megan M. Herzog
- 37 The Opinion Assignment Power, Justice Scalia's Un-Becoming, and *UARG*'s Unanticipated Cloud over the Clean Air Act *Richard J. Lazarus*
- 51 *UARG*—Not a Chef d'Oeuvre of Opinion Writing *Craig N. Oren*
- 63 Anti-Regulatory Skewing and Political Choice in *UARG William W. Buzbee*
- 79 But What About Texas? Climate Disruption Regulation in Recalcitrant States Thomas O. McGarity
- 93 Toward a More Rational Environmental Policy *Richard L. Revesz.*

Articles

- 107 Fracking, Federalism, and Private Governance Amanda C. Leiter
- 157 Biodiversity on the Brink: The Role of "Assisted Migration" in Managing Endangered Species Threatened with Rising Seas *Jaclyn Lopez*

191 Environmental Settlements and Administrative Law Courtney R. McVean and Justin R. Pidot

Student Note

241 Castles Made of Sand: Public-Interest Litigation and China's New Environmental Protection Law Daniel Carpenter-Gold

Case Comments

- 275 Scialabba v. Cuellar de Osorio Brenden Cline
- 293 EPA v. EME Homer City Generation, L.P.: Agencies Can Consider Costs in the Face of Statutory Silence Ryland Li

THE HARVARD ENVIRONMENTAL LAW REVIEW ADVISORY BOARD

Barry Breen American University, Washington College of Law

Sue Briggum Waste Management, Inc.

Karen Florini Environmental Defense Fund

Jody Freeman Harvard Law School

James E. Krier University of Michigan Law School

Richard Lazarus Harvard Law School James P. Leape WWF International

Amanda Leiter American University, Washington College of Law John Leshy University of California, Hastings College of Law Edward M. Norton TPG Capital and Conservation Lands Foundation

Zygmunt J.B. Plater Boston College Law School

Donald W. Stever K&L Gates LLP

Linda Stuntz Stuntz, Davis & Staffier, P.C.

A. Dan Tarlock Chicago-Kent College of Law

The Harvard Environmental Law Review

VOLUME 39 • 2015 • NUMBER 1

Editors in Chief Samantha Caravello Genevieve Parshalle

Managing Editors
Anna Gunderson
Cecilia Segal
Ellie Tarlow

Executive Editors
Esther Silberstein
Carter Hall

Online Editor Ted Hamilton

Article Editors

Michael Barclay† Sabrina Baum†* Dakotah Burns† Marina Cassio†

Brenden Cline Alexandra Jordan Rachel Kenigsberg†

Technical Editors

Daniel Carpenter-Gold*

Will Cranch*

Sean Lyness

Kyle Pietari

Lauren Richburg†

Editors

William Ahee Seng-Hwan Chun Christian Clark Kevin Crandall Jessica Goodman Paige Griffiths† Taylor Lane Shih-Wei Lu† Corey McGehee† Tommy Miller Cassie Mitchell David Pirko Kelsey Skaggs John Shepard Max Straus Rohemir Ramírez Ryan Romain Jon Whitney† Christi Zaleski*

Staff

Maryam Abaei‡ Melissa Alpert Hannah Belitz Olivia Bensinger Cade Carmichael Ying-Chu Chen‡ Sara Dewey Kelly Earle Josh Friedmann† Seth Hoedl‡ Yanping Lu‡ Scott Olmsted Byron Ruby

Korey Silverman-Roati
Pradeep Arjan Singh‡
Robin Alexander Smith
Andy Spore‡
Xixi Tian†
Luis Urbina
Penelope Yan

Harvard Environmental Law Review

Harvard Law School
Caspersen Student Center, Suite 3039
1585 Massachusetts Avenue
Cambridge, MA 02138
hlselr@mail.law.harvard.edu
www.harvardelr.org

The *Harvard Environmental Law Review* is published semiannually by Harvard Law School students. Views expressed in HELR are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of its members.

Editorial Policy: HELR has adopted a broad view of environmental affairs to include such areas as land use and property rights; climate change; air, water, and noise regulation; toxic substances control; radiation control; energy use; workplace pollution; science and technology control; and resource use and regulation. HELR is interested in developments on local, state, federal, foreign, or international levels.

Submissions: The editors welcome comments on and criticism of present and past volumes. The editors also welcome the submission of articles for publication. Authors interested in submitting manuscripts should contact HELR at the earliest possible date, at least six months before publication. Submissions by mail should be typed, and double-spaced. All submissions should also be by e-mail, with a Microsoft Word document as an attachment. The text of the e-mail should include the author's complete contact information. Footnotes should comply with *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010). Unpublished manuscripts will be returned only if accompanied by return postage.

Subscriptions: Subscription rates for the 2015 volume (Volume 39) are \$42 domestic; \$52 foreign (including Canada). For some international subscribers delivery via air mail may be more reliable than standard service, so please note in your inquiry if you would like surface or air mail. All correspondence concerning subscriptions should be addressed to the Subscriptions Manager, Student Journals Office, Harvard Law School, Caspersen Student Center, Suite 3039, 1585 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02138; +1 617 495-3694; E-mail to: sprosper@law.harvard.edu. Claims for missing issues of Volume 38 will be honored only until January 2016.

Back Issues: Back issues may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209-1987. Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at +1 800 828-7571, via fax at +1 716 883-8100, or e-mail to order@wshein.com. Back issues can also be found in electronic format for all your research needs on HeinOnline http://heinonline.org.

Permission to Copy: The articles in this issue may be reproduced and distributed, in whole or in part, by nonprofit institutions for educational purposes including distribution to students, provided that the copies are distributed at or below cost and identify the author, the *Harvard Environmental Law Review*, the volume, the number of the first page, and the year of the article's publication.